THE BATUAN UNARANG DISPUTE AND ITS IMPLICATION FOR MALAYSIA-INDONESIA BILATERAL RELATIONS

PATRICIA NIRMALA DANIEL

PROJECT PAPER SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTERS OF SOCIAL SCIENCES (STRATEGY AND DIPLOMACY)

FACULTY OF SOCIAL SCIENCES AND HUMANITIES
UNIVERSITI KEBANGSAAN MALAYSIA
BANGI

2008
DECLARATION

I hereby declare that the work in this project paper is my own except for quotations and summaries which have been duly acknowledged.

7 June 2008

PATRICIA NIRMALA DANIEL
P 41780
ABSTRACT

A plethora of factors have been instrumental in Malaysia and Indonesia fostering close bilateral ties. These include historic, geopolitical, economic, security, blood ties, and a common heritage. During the Cold War era, relations were severed due to the Confrontation which involved armed conflict between them. However, with the demise of the Soekarno regime, the new leadership worked closely with the Malaysian counterpart to reestablish bilateral relations. Since then, the security and economic sectors of these states have developed to become more integrated and interdependent. In the post Cold War era, Malaysia and Indonesia still have issues that emerge from time to time to cause a strain in the relations. Recently, territorial claims between these parties have become an area of concern, particularly after the International Court of Justice decision in 2002 that the sovereignty of Sipadan and Ligitan islands belong to Malaysia. The Batuan Unarang maritime territorial dispute which peaked in early 2005 had both states on alert in preparation for an armed conflict but leaders have opted for a diplomatic solution instead. This research seeks to examine the general ties between Malaysia and Indonesia particularly from 2001 to 2007, so as to study whether the Batuan Unarang dispute had any negative impact on the political, security, and economic dimensions of the bilateral relations. Primary sources including interviews and discussions with relevant persons in the field was used. Secondary sources such as books, journals, newspaper reports and the internet were some of the sources used. The research employed the Idealist theory and the concept of Interdependence to explain the behaviour of these states in addressing matters that are related to the political, security, and economic dimensions of their bilateral ties. It was found that the Malaysia and Indonesia continue to maintain strong bilateral relations. Despite a temporary strain in relations at the height of the Batuan Unarang dispute, the political, security, and economic dimensions remain stable and unaffected to any significant degree. The research has verified the Idealist view that states can cooperate for their common good, choosing diplomacy over armed conflict as the preferred means to settle a dispute.
CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DECLARATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRAK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONTENTS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REFERENCES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CHAPTER I INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background 1
1.2 Problem Statement 4
1.3 Hypothesis 6
1.4 Objectives of Study 6
1.5 Scope 7
1.6 Significance of Study 7
1.7 Literature Review 8
1.8 Conceptual Framework 12-
  1.8.1 Influence of Globalization 13
  1.8.2 Liberalism and Interdependence 14
CHAPTER II BACKGROUND TO MALAYSIA-INDONESIA BILATERAL RELATIONS

2.1 Introduction 23
2.2 The Pre-Independence Days 23
2.3 The Cold War Era 25
2.3.1 Indonesia's Setting 25
2.3.2 Malaysia's Setting 27
2.3.3 Bilateral Relations in the Cold War 28
  2.3.3.1 Political Dimension 28
    2.3.3.1.1 From Malaya to Malaysia 28
    2.3.3.1.2 Indonesia Opposes Malaysia 29
    2.3.3.1.3 ASEAN 30
  2.3.3.2 Security Dimension 32
  2.3.3.3 Economic Dimension 33
2.4 Post Cold War Era 34
2.4.1 Indonesia's Setting 35
2.4.2 Malaysia's Setting 37
2.4.3 Bilateral Relations in the Post Cold War Era 39
CHAPTER III MARITIME TERRITORIAL DISPUTES AND THE BATUAN UNARANG DISPUTE

3.1 Introduction 49

3.2 Maritime Disputes and Settlements in the Region: a Flashback 49

3.2.1 Timor Gap Treaty 50

3.2.2 Thailand/Malaysia Joint Development Area 51

3.2.3 Analysis of Past Settlements 52

3.3 Territorial Claims in the Sulawesi Sea Between Malaysia and Indonesia 53

3.3.1 The History of Boundary Agreements 53

3.3.2 The Sipadan and Ligitan Dispute 55

3.3.2.1 Origin of the Dispute 56

3.3.2.2 The Basis for Claim: Malaysia Versus Indonesia 57
3.3.2.3 Analysis of the Sipadan and Ligitan Islands Dispute 59

3.3.3 The Batuan Unarang Dispute 60
3.3.3.1 Origin of the Dispute 61
3.3.3.2 The 2005 Dispute Saga 62
3.3.3.3 Legal and Technical Aspects 66
3.3.3.4 The Batuan Unarang Dispute: An Analysis 72

3.4 Summary 75

CHAPTER IV THE BATUAN UNARANG DISPUTE AND MALAYSIA-INDONESIA BILATERAL RELATIONS

4.1 Introduction 77

4.2 Political Dimension 79
4.2.1 Analysis for Political Dimension 83

4.3 Security Dimension 87
4.3.1 Analysis For Security Dimension 90

4.4 Economic Dimension 95
4.4.1 Trade 2001-2007 95
CHAPTER V CONCLUSION

5.1 Findings 106

REFERENCES 110
APPENDIX

A. Organisation Chart of the General Border Committee
   Malaysia-Indonesia